

Report

A Study of Reading Pedagogy in Early Grades in Odisha and Uttar Pradesh

Conducted by
Professor Minati Panda, and
Ms. Rohini Nag

Zakir Husain Centre for Educational Studies
School of Social Sciences
Jawaharlal Nehru University
New Delhi

Introduction

To improve reading pedagogy in schools, innate cognitive resources that the children's minds use, the culturally developed human knowledge and artifacts like multilinguality, writing and reading tools such books, slates, copies, video resources etc. and more able peers that mediate children's thought are to be discovered as tools in harboring pedagogic systems in schools. One can move to riving questions of how human minds work in speech, reading and writing only when the intermediary roles of the semiotic resources including linguistic resources are fully explicated in a local community-school context. The present study examines the pedagogic practice of early reading with special focus on the kind of linguistic resources that get generated in the inter-psychological plane between the children and the teacher by different material and pedagogic tools in select primary schools in Odisha and Uttar Pradesh.

Reading as an act would not resemble any kind of memorizing activity as it not only connects to the recognition of alphabets and its relation to sounds, but also to recognizing word order, graphemes and finally building of syntactic structures. An oblique assumption therefore can be made here about 'reading' as an everyday *school* activity that takes place both outside and inside child's brain. Linguistic (oral and written) resources, and other forms of social-psychological and cognitive resources need to be present and worked out within a pedagogic framework of child centric multilingual approach that allows freedom, reflexivity and identity to learners to become an independent reader. Both the school and the community need to work together to optimize resources mentioned above that may result in reading practices that adhere to an academic appropriation. Classroom appropriation of reading makes it no longer an act, but an activity made that demands appropriation in thought, action and speech. Therefore it only praises the innate capability of the child's mind to assert into complex symbolic systems (via the given language) and mix, switch and mesh linguistic codes. The act of reading then becomes a skill that can and must be tutor independent.

Theoretically, the relationship between the teacher and the learner can be maneuvered into two umbrellas. One is the paradigmatic assumption and the other is the parametric assumption. For early grade reading (EGR), both play equivalent roles through various metadata, metalinguistic, metacognitive operations that create a skill-

that of the act of reading. Reading in itself determines the course of the child's understanding of the other knowledge repertoire (in the textbook) say pictures, graphics, colourful memes etc. that act as factors accumulating to the enactment of 'reading'. Practices therefore govern the reading act of a group, a range or a pattern in which identification of texts, symbols, space between words, whole and part words, grapheme and sentential frames develop. From an individual skill reading becomes a collective process when undertaken by the teacher in her own means. Children participate in the activities organized by the teachers. The pedagogic exercises generated by the teachers in the classroom mediate the early reading activities among children. Most teachers have implicit theories of reading that create a gamut of form and content based interactions in the classroom that take place through multiple nodes in the classroom.

Teacher intervention, student-student interactions, group-learning, imitation, recitals, language activities and games constitute the ground for comprehension and production of a semiotic system that mediates the activity of reading in the classroom. The language of the text and the knowledge universe of the teacher and the folk bridging the school and community contribute uniquely to reading in the classroom. These multiple nodes straighten the assumptions of reading as a practice and reading as an activity. For the sake of understanding the two separately, reading as practice can be confirmed when a group (say the classroom) unites in the same understanding and works towards the same proficiency, same absorption of text material, same performance in 'reading' collectively. But any standard observation of a classroom tells us that although a classroom adopts an egalitarian approach (same textbook, classrooms, same activities allotted to all etc.) each classroom has a distinct nature and is certainly a different social praxis. This is true especially in the case of lower primary classes (say classes 1-4 or so) where children's minds are delimited. Their mental capacities are innate. Their capabilities, performances, mindfulness ultimately consummating the act of reading could give rise to distinctly individual trajectories for readers.

Some of the parametric assumptions mentioned above were designed to grasp the uniqueness in building textbooks and TLMs for Reading Grade appropriate texts. The reader/learner recognizes, understands, decodes, breaks, bridges, and joins different word clusters in collectively designed classroom activities that lead subsequently to knowledge huddles for the readers. This collective level phenomenon results in the readers individually gaining the skill for reading. These factors have been considered as the parameters to elaborate early grade reading (EGR) sharpening the question of the

‘individual reader’ and the ‘collective reader’. The two again, can be looked at from the point of view that for development of tools or materials, a reading independent text must focus on the individual ‘reading skill acquisition’ rather than an accumulative account of the entire classroom that does not provide a sharp focus.

The present study therefore attempts to study the reading pedagogy used in the rural schools of Odisha and Uttar Pradesh. A total of eight schools were selected, five from Odisha and 3 from Uttar Pradesh. The schools in Odisha were from the tribal belt of Mayurbhanj district catering to the children of two tribes- Santhals and Munda. In Uttar Pradesh, three schools located in the Muslim, Dalit and tribal neighbourhoods respectively were selected. The purpose of this study is to examine the reading pedagogy in classes where children’s home language is different from the school language. Another rationale behind selection of these schools is to study the phenomenon of reading in the intersectionality of caste, gender, ethnicity and poverty.

The data were collected using field survey methods that included interviews of parents and teachers, classroom observation, focused group discussion and planned intervention based enquiry.

Brief Profile of Schools in Odisha

School 1

Name of the School:	Jamsori Primary School, Odisha
Number of Teachers:	02
Number of Students:	60

Jamsori Primary School was an Odia medium school where children from a tribe called Santhal were studying. The children speak Santhali language at home and learn in Odiya language in school. There were two teachers. One of them spoke, instructed and guided children in Odia, whereas the other teacher being from the Santhali community used Santhali words intermittently while teaching Odiya language subject. Children from classes 2 and 3 were fully able to read in Odia. The class 2 children were asked to read texts from the textbook of class 3 and could read fluently and proficiently.

Teachers in this school did not use their own TLMs. They rather made good use of state provided TLMs in Odia.

School 2

School name: Makorkenda Project Upper Primary School- Odia-Odia (MT Mundari)

Number of teachers: 02

Number of Students: 67

Makorkenda Project Upper Primary School was an Odia medium school where children from a tribe called Munda were studying. The children spoke Mundari language at home and learnt in Odiya language in school. School had newly recruited headmaster who had appointed one teacher from the community so that she could teach using MLE approach. The children read library books on Saturday. The textbook learning and the language of instruction remained Odia even though the school catered predominantly to the Mundari speakers. Mundari was used intermittently in the classroom by the teachers and the students.

School 3

School Name: Saikura Girls Nodal Upper Primary School- Odia-Odia (MT Odia)

Number of teachers: 04

Number of students: Present on the day of survey

Grades 1&2- 14 girls

Grade 4- 14 girls

Grade 3&5- 08 girls

Grade 6- 32 girls

Grade 7: 13 girls

The Saikura Girls Nodal Upper Primary School was a Odia medium school catering to children from the Saikura village. The women teachers were from the same village who began their day with half an hour long *asanas* and prayer after which classes commenced. Most of the girls from the Saikura village were enrolled in this school. The children came to school with a working knowledge of Odia that they speak/listen to in their homes.

School 4

School Name: Nuasahi Primary School- Mundari-Odia (MT Mundari/ MLE)

Number of teachers: 02

Number of Students: 44

The Nuasahi Primary School was located in the Munda community. The school was located on the main road not very far away from the village. One half of the village seemed to be living a vigorous lifestyle while the other lived in poverty. The unique feature of village was that most of the children were going to the coaching centers located on the roadside. According to five women interview from this village, as the farmer husbands go off to the fields, the children are sent to the coaching centers. Few children from this village were studying in the district school and some were attending the Nuasahi Primary school where teachers were teaching using MLE methodology.

School 5

School Name: Kaliapada Project Upper Primary School (Odia-Mundari/ MT Mundari/ MLE)

Number of Teachers: 06

Number of Students: 143

The Kaliapada Project Upper Primary School was an Multilingual Education (MLE) school. It comprised of 5 classrooms one of which had been converted into a 'creative laboratory' where all MLE TLMs were created and stored by the teacher. This school was located very close to the Nuasahi school. Many children from nearby schools come and sit in these schools as Mundari teacher teaches were teaching in Mundari language and then gradually shifting to Odia language.

Brief Profile of Schools in Uttar Pradesh

School 6 & 7

School Name: Balha Primary School

Number of teachers: 02

Number of Para-teachers: 02

Number of students: Present on the day of survey

Grades 1, 2&3: 50

Grade 5: 27 (5 girls among them)

The Balha Primary School was located in Balha block and was catering to the Muslim children predominantly coming from Bhalla block. Many children came from other villages to live with their extended relatives in this village. They attended classes in this school even though they were not enrolled in the school registers. This community had an average size of 6-11 per family all of whom do not end up going to the village school. Although awareness to teach female children was there, but most of the girls do not show interest in formal schooling they sent to learn Koran in the nearby Madrasa. Girl children from this village often visit Madrasas but are absent from this school.

School 8

School Name: The Tharu Tribal School in Pachpedwa

Number of teachers: 02 (1 from community and the other a proper recruit)

No. of Classrooms: 02

The Tharu Tribal School was located in Pachpedwa. On the day of survey very few were present. Grades 1 and 2 along with about 10 students from classes 4 and 5 were present. This village was about 35kms away from Nepal and was patrolled by the army. The teachers were of the view that the village was not safe for girl children because they wake up as early as 4 a.m. in the morning to go to the deep forests to bring firewood for the house. They do so in groups these days as it has become very unsafe for them to travel anywhere alone. Tharu girls say that taking care of their homes is very important as the male members thrive on some sort of homemade liquor. The researchers were warned to leave the village before 3 p.m. in the afternoon because the men drink heavily in the evening. Women of the community do more work than men who lead a sedentary life. Community in general does not have any literacy practices. The local newspaper stand was 12 kilometers away from the village.

Part I

Analysis of Reading Data from Odisha and Uttar Pradesh

This section presents the classroom observation data as well as the outcomes of the planned intervention based enquiry and analyses from the point of view of reading pedagogy as practiced in the classrooms in Odisha and Uttar Pradesh.

“Bombastic Word Approach” in Guided Read Aloud Activity

In Saikura Girls Nodal Upper Primary School (Non-MLE) (**School 1**), the teacher introduced what she calls “bombastic words” in the beginning of grade 2, where children were encouraged to read essays written on the blackboard. The act of reading took place through identification of the string of sentences written on the blackboard and the task was to identify the given material and read aloud. Three children from the class read aloud what was written on the board, however there was a preliminary step before the loud/audible reading took place. The teacher insisted that children identify such ‘bombastic’ or bigger, unfamiliar words, practice them and then go on to read the essay she had written on the board. These bombastic words worked as triggers for recalling the string of words in the sentence. The sentences were orally practiced and remembered while reciting with the help of the teachers and the bombastic words helped as cues to remember the sentence. This was a reading practice not solely textbook dependent. With the proficiency in identifying these words, children oriented themselves into reading sentences in the textbook. In their mind, they have already constructed *how to read*.

Translanguaging in Guided Read Aloud Activity

In the Nuasahi Primary School (MLE) (**School 3**), the children trans-linguaged often between Odia and Mundari and learnt through MLE teaching learning materials. They were divided in groups by the headmaster who was the MLE trained teacher. He introduced both numbers and alphabets in groups so that children were able to recognize both simultaneously. Children were able to write alphabets in grades 1 and 2 upon dictation. They read Odia alphabets after they were introduced to letters and the

concepts in Mundari, for example- words/pictures referring to some instruments and tools in the Munda community were used to introduce Odia alphabets thus recognizing both the alphabets in Odia and the object given in the picture in the TLM from Munda community. The teacher helped to create a linguistic repertoire in Odia and Mundari as he generated many words both in Odia and Mundari with one alphabet. The teacher gave many examples of one/two syllable words in Odia that had a Mundari counterpart.

Reading Activities in UP:

In grade 1 of the school located in the Muslim area in Balha Block (School 6), the teacher opened a page of the book where already pictorial identification is made of the national flag. Children recognized through graphics rather than the content and the page number. The act of reading in grade 1 involved recognizing alphabets with the help of pictures and illustrations. One child was asked if he can read– ‘*Tume padhna aata hai?*’ Another child responds for the her- ‘*usko padhna nahi awat hai.*’

Many children were absent due to flood and could not follow up with the rest of the class. Most students were going to the fields to incise paddy. The school was also recovering from flood impairments. The students who missed classes were able to identify pictures but when alphabets were stringed together they couldnot perform the act of reading by recognizing the word. The teacher roughly drew a house on the blackboard and children were able to recognize what they called ‘*ghar*’, but upon asking what the picture of window stand for in Hindi, a clue had to be given to them, say, ‘*khi se..?*’ Then they repeated saying ‘*khi se khidki....*’ without actually recognizing the letters that made the word *khidki*. When this word was given to them out of context they were not able to recognize or read the word. Most children didn’t have enough notebooks, copies and pens.

In the school located in Dalit area of Bhalla block (School 7) (Activity 2), the teacher drew a picture of a hut representing houses in the village. Children immediately recognize the picture and shouted, *ghar*. Word becomes concept, when asked to show a room that children pointed out. The children were then asked to write the word *kamraa* in Hindi. In practicing the first step to write this word, the children refused to frame three syllable word. The activity stopped abruptly. This classroom had children from grades 1 and 2 sitting together on one side and those from grades 3 and 4 sitting on the other side of the classroom. Special arrangements were made during flood and class

lessons had been resumed not until children were able to read one sentence together. Most children during this activity were absent minded and were unable to follow instructions given to them in Hindi.

Activity 3: The sentence *Ram paani peeta hai* was given to identify reading pattern. The sentence was broken into two syllables each, but the conjoining *matra* was not recognized. Alphabets were recognized faster than a whole word. Upon asking, the children remained silent.

(Activity 4): The students from grade 5 in school 6 were given a compound sentence- “*Kal Sarla school gayi..*” where the SOV order in Hindi was wholly recognized. The words could be classed in nouns, verbs and adjectives. The children demonstrated understanding of the grammatical categories without formal instructions. Another sentence was given- ‘*Gopal khet jothta hai.....*’ The children were asked about understanding of constituency of sentences, say, the verb ‘*joth-ta*’ and if it can be replaced by ‘*jaa-ta*’. The children said yes, but the meaning will change.

Recognition and Knowledge of Alphabets and Phonetic Awareness:

School 1: Grades 1 and 2 (as in many schools) sat in the same classroom in groups. As the teacher put it, grades 1 and 2 were the “foundation class” and they “work together” to build skills of reading, writing, enacting and elocution. The spatial arrangement of the classroom was such that the children interacted with each other while learning and reading aloud any poem or any chapter the teacher asked them to. The class began using guided reading. The children were helped to identify one syllable and move to the other, for example-]cha] + [ta] is *chata* (*means mat*). It is the mat on which they sit. They recognized that the two individual phonetic components build a word. Voiceless palatal fricative /ch/ with the retroflex /t/ creates a word which they were already aware of phonologically because in Odia which was spoken in this area and in the school provides adequate understanding of the phonetic units of the Odia words from beforehand and they learn to read and write formally in school. Similarly the whole phonetic unit was introduced that conjoins to form newer words, like /ch/ which could be replaced by voiceless bilabial plosive /p/ plus retroflex /t/ to make *pot*. Children could reference the words mentally as this already existed in their lexicon. When we asked the teachers

about the phonetic rehearsals, the teacher said that even the parents at home do some of these phonetic rehearsals to communicate the meaning of the compound words.

Next step involved joining of the words in Odia language. This was introduced with the help of TLMs developed by the teacher herself. She had designed activities like 'fill in the blanks' with '*matrayukt*' words (words with a conjoining *matra*), which were read in their pictorial sense and the sound that carried with them. Matras thence were identified and small words were given to children to join and make new words and tell how these could be pronounced. Not all of them could join and read independently in grade 1. The teacher therefore ensured 'guided reading' for them. She gave simple two-three word sentences which were read aloud with guidance from the teacher.

School 8: This school had children from the Tharu tribe who spoke mostly in two languages in the classroom. They did not have any comprehension disparities when the instructional language was Hindi. Teacher initiated conversations on the chapter- 'Main aur mera desh..' and introduced the chapter formally in Hindi. Tharu girls volunteered to read the most and were proficient in Hindi. While talking amongst themselves, they spoke in their 'home language' which they said would benefit them while learning prose if some of their own words are used to explain formal concepts from the lesson.

Activity 5: A standard reading test was given to the multi-grade classroom of grades 3, 4 and 5 which included the following only: a) Identifying the cover of the book (b) Identifying the back of the book (c) Identifying page numbers (d) Identifying punctuation marks (e) Identifying spaces between words. Tharu children were able to identify the given tasks however the boys in the same grade were unable to locate what was being asked. Both (c) and (d) remained undetermined whereas (e) was comprehended without deterring. For grades 1 and 2 shared reading happens through repetition where in group reading one child reads and the other repeat often without knowing what they are reading or learning a sentence at all. They are not introduced to punctuation marks but are able to identify the front and back cover of book and are able to spell the title '*Kalrav*'. They are not able to identify or read any other textbook other than their own. Children are otherwise very proficient while reciting rhymes.

I. Shared and Model Reading: School 1: One of the major contributor to reading in ...school was group reading. Group reading usually took place through reading of

storybooks other than the textbooks and outside the class hours. Two days a week children read aloud from story books photocopied and brought to class as TLM for grades 1 and 2. For grade 1, books were richer in pictures and had very short sentences. For grade 2, the arrangement was the same but with a little longer utterances. This activity was borne by the idea of “excess words” which meant a repertoire of words to be created in the child’s mind that was referential and make meaning. If the textbook includes a few words from the chapter, story books brought in newer words but within the same semantic field.

II. School 6: Children of grade 1 show eagerness to recite and often recite together what Para-teacher teaches them. She makes them enact and recite poems and children are able to remember the poems by a repetitive pattern the teacher induces. Children sit in a row where one child begins reading, the next joins and then the whole row reads aloud. They usually repeat 2 lines each from a poem from their language textbook and continue until they have memorized. Upon asking to point fingers on the textbook and read a random line children were often confused between very small two/three word sentences they were asked to read. They often repeated lines from memory but their fingers would point on the wrong sentence. Reading more often than not, occurs through memorization and not the *act* of reading takes place.

Activity 6: Prose reading exercise was given to which they seemed averagely enthusiastic and were not in conversation with the teacher at all in comparison to the friendly, free atmosphere in the school and with the teacher in Odisha. Reading happened more enthusiastically and sharp focus was put on developing such skill set. Grade 5 onwards reading standards became poorer although children were not speaking up, or were not vocal enough to be audible. Upon asking to deliver an informal extempore on any given topic they often hesitated and one boy who does fairly well in class stands up but is unable to say anything apart from the name of the topic. Reading as such did not feature in their skill set.

Two teachers in Odisha claimed to use novel **pedagogic intervention**. In School, the teacher engaged her students with asking and *reading* questions. She believed that if a child is able to read a question and understand what has to be done immediately with that question, then the child can independently carry out the activity without being guided. She implemented different question patterns on the blackboard and coaxed them to reading slowly. Children memorize the question pattern by reading it

repeatedly and asked questions to one another. For example- If the teacher writes '*Fill in the blanks*' on the blackboard, children helped each other read the instructions. She then wrote '*What did the crow do?*' after telling the story, '*The Thirsty Crow*'. The children were encouraged to ask this as well other questions to each other to discuss. The burden of answering the question was reduced. The children didn't require memorizing the answers. This exercise increased the interaction between written text, meaning and mutual interaction in a relatively stress free environment.

School 4: This is an MLE school where MLE TLMs are widely used in teaching/ learning. Teacher makes thermocol cut outs in the shape of fishes and Odia alphabets to teach the lower primary grades up to grade 3. He then fixes the thermocol fish heads to a magnet and a stick hung with a thread that resembles a fishing apparatus and allows children to pick from the fish cut outs on which he has marked Odia alphabets to find the correct letters to match the words given on the board. He also makes a pencil sketch of picture stories like '*The clever fox*' etc. representing some of the old folk tales that children like to listen to. In all, the resemblance of fishing and fish cut outs represents one of the main activities of the Munda tribals of Kalipada that is pond fishing. Children as a part of their everyday life recognize this activity from which the teacher (a member of the Munda community) helps them understand their education better both from their lives and in school. The last period, usually after the midday meals become hectic for the children to sit inside the classroom and study so their teacher makes them walk around inside the school garden making a chain-train and asks them to observe whatever comes their way. From the school paraphernalia children memorize what they see as they pass in their walking exercise and come back to their school verandas asked to make 5 sentences with what they saw. Munda children are able to write perfectly in Odia and make sentences and hurry to show them to their teacher.

Upon interview, teacher says that this exercise helps them memorize, retain and create a number of words and sentences they process visually and are able to join and write with what they have learned in class. He therefore creates a bridge between the common everyday existences with formal schooling through combinatorial activities. The school ends with a folklore, a '*lokgeet*' that the master sings with his children in the EVS class whose cacophony would join in their physical actions (generating Total Physical Response TPR) singing '*Ami tabla bojaini janichu...*'[3] All of the

activities are instructed in Mundari replacing musical instruments like flute, harmonium in the song with actions in Mundari. There are 6 teachers and 143 children in this school who continue with MLE practices as well as their own significantly like this one teacher who induces novel pedagogic methods in his own 'creative laboratory' as he calls it.

III. Independent Reading and Decoding Unknown Words:

School 1: The teacher thinks children should generate their own ideas. If her class suggests they read a story instead of doing math, the teacher lets them do so. [2] This keeps their interest and attention alive and also intuitively makes them practice what they have learned so far. She discussed the following points:

(a) **Habitual Reading:** Continuous exposure to reading storybooks and textbooks and other TLMs will improve reading proficiency and develop reading as a skill if repeated and habitually maintained. Visual processing of words and sentences (*drishti likhan*)—dictation (*shruti likhan*)—Q&A (solving easy questions).

(b) **Speech Preparation:** Grades 1 and 2 children can understand general instructions like 'Sit down', 'wish good morning', 'turn around' and the like. So they already have a prepared idea of what is being told whether it is a small question or an immediate command. Teacher says, with the development of these instructions and the words + sentences taught through her TLMs children can prepare their own speech, meaning they can answer back about the given instruction, in small holophrastic or two word utterances. They mostly however, nod their heads.

(c) **Paragraph writing:** The introduction of small paragraphs on any topic to generate questions. The identification and understanding of question patterns might allow children to perform the act of reading for which they have to struggle to decipher the paragraph. This also includes choices and freedom of activities by the children.

(d) **Grammar and phonetic awareness:** Mostly picked up from the environment and in class reading activities are also conducted through acting. Grammar is not immediately introduced as much as reading is, identification and recognition of singular phonetic and morphological units are introduced which enables the child to identify/read similar words or short sentences.

VI. Fluency and Comprehension:

School 2: To record fluency and comprehension (also textbook grade independent reading) children of grade 2 were asked to read the language

textbook of grade 3 in this Odia medium school. Random texts were selected, some paragraphs and some prose that were read with competence by the grade 2 children. Children are fully able to comprehend sentences given to them from a textbook that is meant for advanced readers of grade 3. As much as this feat was well coveted this school comprised of both Santhali and Odia children. Grades 2 and 3 are proficient in reading but higher classes starting from grade 5-7 are unable to immediately identify complex words.

Transition, pattern recognition from one to multi-syllable words: From the table below we find that, recognition of conjunct consonants (*yuktakshar*) had gaps in reading or comprehending from the blackboard. If sounds like [skɑ] in ‘*abiskara*’ had difficulty in identification [gyɑ] in ‘*bigyana*’ was recognized by some Odia children. The *yuktakshar* [khŋɑ] deters recognition as the third syllable even if the word ‘*akankhya*’ is partly recognized by the Santhali child. Odia children however, recognize the word wholly. In Odia, the penultimate syllable of all words end with a roundedness. For example ‘*bhalluka*’ ends in [kɔ] as in the case of ‘*gambhiro*’ that ends in roundedness of [rɔ]. This is recognized both by Santhali and Odia children. In multi-syllable words like ‘*adhmatika*’ Santhali children were completely unable to identify the combination of conjunct consonants [dhma] in Odia that is pronounced as [tsm] in Santhali for the same combination in this word. However, this went completely unrecognized. Santhali children in the same class struggled, although 12 children were present amongst the class of 23 on the day of survey. However some in class can recognize and some cannot, assuming that this activity (7) was given:

Grade: 5 / School-2

No. of children present: 13 out of 23.

Word (one/two syllables)	Recognition	Whole/part recognition
<i>Akshara</i>	recognized	Whole recognition
<i>Bigyana</i>	recognized	Whole recognition
<i>Abiskara</i>	[skɑ] deterred recognition and	Part recognition

fluency

Table 1.1

Word (3 syllables)	Recognition <i>matras/syllables</i>	Whole/part recognition
<i>Sambako</i>	recognized	Whole recognition
<i>Akankhya</i>	[khŋa] deterred recognition	Part recognition
<i>Bhalluko</i>	recognized	Whole recognition
<i>Gambhiro</i>	recognized	Whole recognition

Table 1.2

Word (multi-syllables)	Recognition <i>matras/syllables</i>	Whole/part recognition
<i>Puraskaro</i>	recognized	Whole recognition
<i>Adhmatika</i>	[dhma] deterred recognition and fluency	Unrecognized
<i>Sambidhano</i>	recognized	Whole recognition
<i>Tiraskara</i>	recognized	Whole recognition

Table 1.3

For grade 4 text selection was random from language textbook where Odia and Santhali children were asked to read one passage each, first from a known text and then from an unknown prose/text amongst 8 children present on the day of survey. Fluency and comprehension did not deter in the case of the known text, general impression would be it was well practiced and as if recited in rote memorization, but all children were able to recognize alphabets upon asking individually from the known and unknown prose reading exercise. A general observation would be that grade 4 did not show much interest in the unknown prose reading activity, fluency was slightly deterred (although an approximated reading comprehension and fluency exercise was given). Use of complex words in poem did not deter fluency or comprehension although teacher intervenes when child (both Odia/Santhali) stops or breaks complex Odia words.

Instructions given in this school is only in Odia where Santhali children only read in Odia-Odia. Children of grade 4 usually sit in a group and read and write on their own until teacher teaches children of grade 2 in the same classroom.

For grade 1 however, a sense of hesitation and fear was there while being asked to read. Grade 1 teachers (the only two in the school) introduce alphabets through Odia TLMs to children and use the standard method of teaching with one syllable words first then moving on to two syllables words and gradually extends to more complex words. *Matra* in Odia words is taught before explaining the words in Odia which for Santhali children is first explained in Santhali and then in Odia (when one Santhali teacher in school teaches). Children tell stories to teachers about their everyday lives at home, Santhali children in particular feel a sense of importance when their words for example- *sim* in Santhali for *kukura* in Odia is pronounced by the teacher and is then taught to class. In the teacher's presence children enact and read stories on their own. Examples of Santhali more formally is included from grade 2 onwards. The total number of children in school 2 are 60 boys and girls with number of teachers-02 (1 Santhali and 1 Odia teacher) in the Jamsori village.

School 3: Children read Odia prose '*Sukhila Patarara Katha*' with equal pace like that of reading Odia words and Mundari words given to them in Odia script.

VII. Motivation (Intrinsic and Extrinsic):

In terms of compensation in school due to lack of support (if any) in education from family. **School 1:** Upon interviewing the teacher on what she thinks is best to develop intrinsic motivation in grades 1 and 2 she used the phrase "*Prattakhya bhaab adaan-pradaan*" (exchange of motivational thoughts) and that creating interest should be the main focus of the teacher. She uses motivational and inspirational words when she enters the class, introduces a random topic for example- 'Independence Day' and children talk amongst themselves in teacher organized groups in the classroom. That in itself motivates them to interact and share productive talk amongst themselves. She promotes the understanding amongst her students that they are all equal in her eyes and should be in each other's too and everyone has the same brain to determine the same problem taught and that nobody is exclusive. She creates a motivational structure amongst her students but concretizing these ideas into practice. Although she mentions rural areas have lesser consciousness about educational activities so teacher does not

wait for supply of TLMs instead makes her own. She buys drawing books, color pens and other stationery for her class. Upon asking if girls are more serious in studies than boys, she smiles and says girls are more laborious but boys are fickle. They all learn together and she calls herself as the 'silent observer'.

Girls in grades 3, 4 and 5 are generally able to recite what has been taught from the textbook, for example- a poem. Girls are actively interested in reading and multi-grade classes take session while they all individually read aloud poems and prose while the others listen and do their activities. Upon repetition of the same utterances again and again by the initiation of the teacher the complete act of reading takes place as much as elocution (through recitation etc.) does. The attitude of the multi-grades amongst girls (as it is a girls' school) remained confident, they were fluent in reading the chapter "*Dalapati Pada Tumaku Shaaje*" a prose excerpt from their language textbook, text selection was random. [1]

School 2: Upon interviewing teachers, their impression was that female children are generally interested to read and pick up the skill quicker irrespective of being Santhali or Odia meaning speaking two different languages. They however trans-language throughout their everyday lives therefore their interest in reading Odia does not have deterring factors at large. Female children are equally enthusiastic about learning mathematics. The last period is usually free for the children where teachers let them draw or write essays of their own choice (higher classes). Girls often showed interest in learning how to write applications, letters etc. They usually begin their school day with mathematics as their first period.

School 6: Grade 5 was given random prose text to read from their language textbooks. Twenty two boys and 5 girls present on that day read together and aloud. Individual reading was found to be deterring confidence in girls. Girls were lesser confident and prompt to read in this class. Although in a general survey, the school girls were interested in studying mathematics and almost everyone likes reading and story-telling. They also want a library that has more books and are allowed to frequent there more often.

Part II

Discussion on Reading Pedagogy and Recommendation for Future

Use of Graphophonemic¹ Method:

The teachers were found using some aspects of the graphophonemic methods for teaching reading to children. Even though the textbooks were developed using principles of whole language approach, the teachers were using a mix of phonetic and whole language approach.

In both the states, the children in class I and II were asked to move their fingers on the words when the teachers read the texts aloud. The teachers generally stressed the initial consonant of a word and helped children associate the letter with the sound. The teachers worked with the assumption that when children put their fingers on a letter and pronounce the word beginning with that letter, they learn the association between the full word and the sound and shape of the letter. Repeated reading helps them learn the correspondence between the first consonant (letter) and its sound. As the children read aloud along with teachers few times a week, they gradually predict the ensuing sequence by looking at the initial consonant. The sound-visual association, the reflexes attached to the finger movement and the mental images formed by the text together help the children repeat the routine of this reading with near perfection. The early reading is complemented by the children's perception of the length of the word, the overall image (called sight vocabulary) and contextualizing of the words within the sentence. Children go back and forth many times to establish these relationships so that they read with meaning despite not having all the letters for the sounds they hear and produce. The reading skills develop in a complex holistic manner, which cannot be explained through its constituents or by few linearly conceivable relationships.

The present study reveals that the children respond differently to the reading activities depending on whether they are regular in school. In Uttar Pradesh, the children who were regular in school and got help at least once a week from an elder sibling or an

¹ Graphophone means the shape or symbol of the graphic input, i.e., the text. Graphophonemic systems work together to help readers guess the right word.

educated elder member from the family showed far more progress in reading activities than those who did not get any. More than 80% of the independent readers in U. P. were the ones who were regular in school. The similar results were found in Odisha too except that in Odisha, the private tutors compensated the absence of an adult sibling or an educated member. The market for private tuitions had significantly expanded in tribal areas in Odisha than in U. P. The per capita expenditure on children's education by the parents was higher in Odisha than in Uttar Pradesh. This was partly because of small family size, increased awareness and aspirations among the parents and children for education and the expanded market for private tuitions.

In Uttar Pradesh, the students who were regular and could read well were the most motivated ones. The students who were irregular and still could read some texts were also found to have a positive self esteem. But the students who were regular and could not independently decode the texts were the most demotivated ones. These are the ones who at least constituted 40% of the class had a blank face. Establishing rapport with them was very difficult. Many of them attain the identity of non-participants and gradually cease to exist for rest of the class including the teacher.

Reading in MLE Schools in Odisha:

In the MLE school of Odisha where the text lessons were from the children's cultural context and the language medium of instruction was children's home language, reading skill was better developed. The teachers introduced words through word name orally produced and children's fingers moving over the concerned words. The first consonant was introduced. There was less use of phonetic method than introducing graphemes orally and visually to children. The link between the MLE school and the pre-school attached to it was better in the area of reading. The anxiety was much less among the early graders and the peer scaffolding was more.

In the non-MLE school, where children's language was different from the textbook language, the reading pedagogy was more phonetically driven than the grapheme. The instructions were more in Odia as the teachers were mostly Odia speakers. Read aloud was a technique equally used in MLE and non-MLE classes though the activities and the teacher pupil and peer interactions that followed were different. Our observation showed that nearly 60% tribal children switch off while doing the routines of reading. They moved their fingers mechanically and reproduced the sounds of words and sentences. They couldn't be cogently pursued to see the

relationship between letters and sound. It is however believed that over a period of time, some of these children may crack the relationship and use those to read. The only precondition to this is that they need ample freedom and motivation to survive in this semi intelligible environment.

The analysis of the linguistic tasks given to the children (see the earlier section) reveal that the tribal children in the MLE classes could use the cognitive resources more than the non-MLE children that helped them predict the chains of sounds and meaning by looking at the first consonant and then subsequently predicting the ensuing word and the grapheme. The facilitators in MLE class were the use of home language and familiar narratives by the teacher, code switching within the syntactic structure of children's home language, experience of less anxiety and fear and activation of relevant cognitive resources mentioned above. The teachers were unknowingly switching from one strategy to another, as the linguistic facilities were more in the MLE classes. In the non-MLE class, because of the constraints with regard to linguistic facilities and the context of the textbook lessons, the children experienced more anxiety and fear. The social-cognitive structure of the reading class was less familiar to the children than it is for the MLE children. This hugely constrained the cognitive-linguistic facilities of Non-MLE children.

According to Goodman, "Within high contextual constraints, an initial consonant may be all that is needed to identify an element and make possible the prediction of an ensuing sequence or the confirmation of prior predictions.....Reading requires not so much skills as strategies that make it possible to select the most productive cues." However, to do this, one needs to engage with this activity of read aloud for a reasonable period time using different small group dynamics and peer scaffolding so that the neural structures get established to provide the reading benefits to children. The children in the process of read aloud discover many graphophonemic cues that help them decode words and sentences for sound-letter associations, the word order and the meaning attached to it.

The children in the MLE school in Odisha out performed the tribal children in non-MLE classrooms in reading because of these facilities. The teacher's motivation was high in MLE school as some of the graphophonemic cues he/she was able to provide were working which gave confidence to the teachers. As is shown in the result section, the teacher in MLE schools could be more creative with his pedagogic tools because he could align his strategies with children's cognition and move with them. All

the scaffolds he provided for reading worked for many children as the children could benefit from the familiarity of texts, the figurative-consonant sound associations and the already discovered syntactic structure of the language. In other words, reading involves the interrelationship of all the language systems.

Wherever the reader had the freedom and the support to do this in the class, she/he decoded the written symbols for meaning early. They sample cues and make judgments about which cues from each system will provide the most useful information in making predictions that will get them to meaning. The teacher in the MLE school in tribal area of Odisha with his expanded and engaging pedagogic tools could hold the children longer with him and therefore could provide multiple graphophonemic cues to facilitate the process of reading.

In nutshell, the graphophonemic methods will be successful only when children's linguistic, cultural and emotional resources are aligned to provide a motivational structure, which holds the children in reading activities longer. Given adequate freedom, the children in such an environment will emerge as independent readers without failure.

Graphophonemic to Lexical and sub-lexical reading and Back

As reported by a teacher in Odisha school, in earlier times, the children were made to write letter and pronounce them correctly before they were taught reading words and sentences. The teaching was not phonetically driven nor was it explicitly graphophonemic. However, in post 2005, the whole language pedagogy was officially advocated both in textbook and in teacher training. The present study shows that both in Odisha and Uttar Pradesh, more than 80% children were involved simultaneously in the lexical reading and graphophonemic reading in class I and II as the teachers and parents still preferred to move from 'part to whole' in reading and writing. In fact, the teachers were found to be using sub-lexical reading more often than it was thought. The classroom observation of reading shows that the teachers used sub-lexical and lexical reading while working with the children individually and graphophonemic method while teaching the whole class. There was frequent movement between graphophonemic and sub-lexical in the beginning and between graphophonemic and lexical in the later part of the year in class I and II. Lot of the reading activities and the pedagogy employed to do so in class I were also used in class II. Our interviews with the parents reveal that at home

the parents used sub-lexical and lexical reading methods. In class IV and V, the relatively poor teachers promoted lexical reading more than the graphophonemic reading. In Uttar Pradesh, the children also read in small groups. The group leaders were without exception independent readers who prompted more than guiding the students in reading. They were using few graphophonemic cues. The peer scaffolding found in guided group reading was minimalist. The small group reading was found helpful in case of three girl students who were not regular in schools. A clear relationship was found between reading and regular attendance in school.

Discovering Syntactic Structure

By the time children come to class I, they already have cracked the syntax of their home language. They don't make mistakes in their oral delivery the basic syntactic order in which the words, phrases and sentences are arranged in their home language. Many children in these areas exhibited a fair amount of understanding of the syntax of the second major language spoken in that community. The notion of ordering in a second language and subsequently its difference or affinity to the first language builds syntactic knowledge among children. The reading program needs to make the children analyse the syntax that they use in their daily communications and the one that is used in the book so that when they read using graphophonemic methods, their intuitive knowledge of syntax help them decode the ensuing words and phrases.

The teachers in schools in Odisha used direct methods to teach the syntax of the school language. They broke the sentences into SOV structure and showed the structure to children. In none of the schools observed by us, we found teachers asking the children to break down the sentences given in the book or the ones orally produced so that they collectively identify the pattern in the ordering of the words and phrases. The monolingual emphasis in the class followed by the part to whole method in teaching of reading failed to allow teachers to create a class where children discover the syntax themselves and articulate those discoveries in collectives. The teachers in tribal areas used children's home language mostly to make the instructions clearer. The tribal languages were not used as linguistic resources along with Odia to discover the syntactic structure of Odiya. This is where the use multilingual resources (which are already there) and the multilingual pedagogy would help enormously the children in learning of a language.

Reading and Schooling in the Intersectionality of Gender, Religion, Ethnicity and Poverty:

In Uttar Pradesh, five to six children each in classes II to V were found to be independent readers and one to two of them were advanced readers. The gender divide was less in class I and II where as in class IV and V, it was huge and was in favour of boys in U. P. In Odisha, the gender divide among the good readers was far less. Even in class V, the number of independent readers among boys was equal to that of girls. The number of independent readers in Odisha schools were higher than those in U. P. schools. In Odisha schools, at least fifty percent in the class could read age appropriate texts in class II to IV and 40% in class V. The Odia students could decode unknown texts appropriate for their grades. Nearly 20% of them could read texts from higher grades too. If one compares the tribal villages in Odisha with Muslim and Dalit villages in U. P., the gender divide was far less.

The tribal parents in Odisha didn't raise the issue of safety for girls though they preferred the girls to be accompanied by their brothers to the coaching centres if these were located beyond 2 to 3 kms from their homes. In Uttar Pradesh, more than 80% of Muslim and Dalit mothers reported safety to be one of the primary reason for withdrawing girl children from the schools. Absentism was more among boys in Uttar Pradesh than in Odisha. Many parents in Uttar Pradesh school reported that the boys tell the mothers that they are going to school, but they generally join the adolescent out of school children to play cards and do other recreational activities. The muslim village in Uttar Pradesh had many migrant families where economic survival receded children's education. Poverty, over-crowding of houses and market, large family size, migration, alcoholism and safety of girl children created multiple of barriers to children's learning in class and reading in particular. The tuition/coaching centres in these villages of Uttar Pradesh were also fewer partly because of the reasons mentioned above.

In both the tribal villages in Odisha, private tuition centres have come up in large numbers not only for secondary and higher secondary students but also for primary school children. Earlier, these tuitions were held in teachers' residence. As a result, the tribal children from higher classes had to go to far off non-tribal villages for tuition. The primary school children had access to the school teachers residing in nearby areas for private tuitions. Now, the tuition centres have mushroomed in the nearby market areas. Many new roadside constructions have come up to house these private tuition centres on commercial basis. We visited three such tuition centres. Our observation reveals that

many primary school children are sent with their elder sibling to attend classes in these centres. Most of the instructors employed in these tuition centres are young non-tribal graduates from nearby towns and villages including Baripada. These centres seem to be playing a huge role in raising the aspirations of the tribal families for higher education. Both the villages had at least two to three women with undergraduate degrees who are now working in schools and other private organizations. This worked both as a motivator and a deterrent as both the girls who completed Graduate degrees in one village remained unmarried. Two mothers of young children mentioned this. Most families in these two villages placed equal and sometime higher priority on girls' education. Few mothers reported that the girls are doing better in school as the boys get into drinking and wrong companies during adolescence where as girls remain indoor and focus more on studies.

Freedom and Motivation in Reading:

What works well with whole language teaching method is freedom (Panda, 2015). The children should be allowed to work freely with the linguistic resources, make mistakes and learn from their mistakes. This was clearly missing in the reading activities observed in U. P. as well as in Odisha schools except when children worked in small groups. Most of the early reading activities were teacher directed and teacher controlled in these schools. The students worked with multiple binaries of right - wrong, reader - non-reader, standard school language – non-standard languages, oral language – written language. These binaries were curtailing the freedom of children to work with their intuitive knowledge and innate cognitive devices.

The human beings are hard wired for acquiring languages. They have enormous capacity to decode and discover the structure of languages that they are exposed to. Given the freedom and opportunities, the children may develop their own strategies for reading. Selection of right kind of graphophonemic cues comes with continuous engagement with reading and the freedom to choose cues for reading maintains the motivational structure for reading. Part of the motivation comes from the identity that a child acquires as a competent reader. The communities that see reading and writing as a significant cultural capital, create a motivational structure for the same. The tribal villages in Odisha prioritized reading over household chores even for women students. The young girls were sent to tuitions everyday for studies. The tuition centres had equal representation of boys and girls. In schools, the girls were doing equally well or in some

classes even better than boys in reading and writing activities.

In Muslim and Dalit areas of Uttar Pradesh, the number of independent readers among girls was less. In class I and II, the boys and girls were doing equally better. Where as in the higher classes, the number of independent readers was more among boys than among girls.

In both Odisha and Uttar Pradesh, the teacher and students knew who in the class are the advanced readers. Every time we asked “who wants to read this text, both teachers and students immediately turned to these students. The identity of a reader was established and valued. When we approached children other than the one who are known as good readers, children in both the states showed tremendous discomfort and withdrawal symptoms. It was amply evident that these children’s identity of non-reader is already established. When we went closer to them to persuade them to read few sentences from the books, they hid behind one another, giggled shyly and occasionally gave a blank look to us. Most children did not find these reactions unreasonable as these children already had obtained the identity of non-reader and therefore hard to crack. Even though the teachers had not given up hopes on these children, they had resigned to the belief that their parents will anyway withdraw these children once they approach marriageable age or are ready for unskilled labour including cultivation or petty business.

Recommendation for Reading

(a) Teaching of Syntax in a Multilingual Class:

All schools that were surveyed in both the states had children speaking at least three languages. The children speaking Urdu, Hindi and Maghi were studying in two UP schools where as children speaking Hindi, Maghi, and Nepali and were studying in the school. In Odisha schools, the children speaking Odia, Mayurbhanji Odia, Santhali and Gondi were studying in the same school. These children could have been asked to look at some simple sentences in each of these languages and decode the ordering of the phrases and units in these sentences. As has been studied by multilingual experts, it is pedagogically simple to analyse different languages spoken in the neighbourhood to see the structure of these languages. The children can discover with little support from the teachers the patterns or words and phrases in a sentence in class I, II, and III and in higher classes analyzing this order using the terms subject, object and verb. In middle and high school, the teachers in schools can create different pedagogic tools through

patterns of words (or function order), inflection and inflectional agreement, use of function words such as noun markers (the, a, that) and the intonation to teach a child how to decode a sentence for meaning and how to make a sentence to create specific meaning.

Some of the questions that could be used by the teachers in primary classes to facilitate learning of syntax include the following: "Can we say it that way? Does that sound right?" "How do you say in the second language that you know?" "How is it said in a third language spoken by another friend in the class?"

The teachers could identify the grammatical themes in the texts from the textbooks and in some of the verbal rapporteur of children and engage the children in decoding the sentences to show these. The following are some of the grammatical themes the teachers in class IV and V could work on:

- Word order
- Complex Sentences
- Verbal complexes
- Argument structure of verbs and Verb movement

(b) What Facilitates Independent Reading in a Multilingual Classroom?

The early readers in primary classes use the lexical, phonetic and the syntactic cue systems simultaneously and interdependently. Therefore, what constitutes useful graphic information depends on how much syntactic and semantic information is available to children in a classroom and how to help children use these cues to decode. In the classes where both the children and the teachers were using children's home language, the graphophonemic methods worked better with students as the semantics and syntactic informations are already there with the children in that language.

In the whole language approach, reading involves children discovering the interrelationship of all the language systems simultaneously and at their own pace. Innovative linguistic activities need to be worked out within the graphophonemic system where letter-sound relationships are established. The children manage the assisted early reading with association of sound and first consonant, the size and the length of the

words, length of the sentence etc. They however need to deal with lot of assisted reading activities and few linguistic cues from the teachers to discover the word configuration, know 'little words' in bigger words (Sandhi), know the whole words and know the relationship between sentence structure and the meaning. Good visuals certainly help them work within a narrative whole. The children no doubt need enough freedom to judge what cues help them get the meaning even when they don't decode every letter or word for a sound.

What constitutes useful graphic information in a class depends on how much syntactic and semantic informations are available to children and how much freedom the children have to decode. Pronouncing individual words involves knowledge of letter organization, meaning and the word order. The graphophonic cues are related to the sounds we hear (the phonological system including individual letters and letter combinations), the letters of the alphabet, and the conventions of spelling, punctuation and print. Most teachers had implicit belief about the importance of the graphophonic cues in reading and they used it in reading activities of children. Students who are emerging readers use these cues considerably. A good reading practice therefore may require lot of early reading (both assisted and free) activities in children's home language, availability of reading materials in those languages, freedom and a motivating teacher who has some understanding of language and mind.

(c) Development of the Semantic System and Critical Psychology Paradigm:

To support the reader in developing the semantic system, one teacher in class V (School in U.P.) was asking questions like " Why did he insult the visitor? "Why did he have to do this?" etc. Another teacher asked the students to respond to the following questions after they finished a lesson in class IV in Odisha, "What is this story all about?" If this story was written by my grand father at a different period of time or in a different country, had the story been different and how?" Another teacher in class IV in Odisha asked his students after finishing the lesson, "Does that make sense"? " I still don't get the story!", "Why, at all..?"

It was evident from the ensuing discussion that the teachers were trying to develop not only a semantic system with the help of these questions, they were helping children engage in critical thinking. However, these activities were limited as both teachers and students were busy in completing the lesson. The teachers were invariable in a hurry to

finish the lessons in the given period. As a result, whenever critical questions are asked, the discussions remained confined to yes/no, or a brief explanation from the student etc. The teachers were not able to create a spiraled discussion on critical issues. A critical reading would require a historical as well as a cultural understanding of the social issues and phenomena. Our class observation in U. P. reveal that whenever teachers raised critical questions, they were to do with politicians. The teachers' views were opinionated and lacked a historical understanding. In other words, the teachers in U. P. school were aware of the need to raise some critical questions in the class, but they had very routine understanding of what constitutes this genre and how to create dialogue with children on these issues. The local problems were sometimes part of classroom discussion in class IV and V, but such discussions lacked historical and political dimensions. The predominant social issues that hindered children's participation in school education like women's general safety, sexual abuse, alcoholism, early marriage etc. were not discussed in these schools.

Countering Text Book Hegemony by Age Appropriate Books in the Library:

The children in almost all the schools had only textbooks in their bags. From the reading point of view, these textbooks were not age appropriate. The stories and songs in class one textbooks were long and meant for the teachers. Nearly 50% of the lessons in the textbooks of class I and 40% of the lessons in the textbook of class II were dense and conceptually inaccessible for independent reading. As a result, the reading activities in the class had to be teacher assisted. The library couldn't fill the gaps as the maximum number of library books that we saw during our school visit didn't exceed 10. Only 3 out of 14 children in class V in the Muslim area of Bhalla bock in U. P. had one additional book from the library.

References

- Goodman, K., & Goodman, Y. (1974). Learning to read is natural. In L. B. Resnick & P. A. Weaver (Eds.), *Theory and practice of early reading* (Vol. 1, pp. 137-154). Hillsdale, NJ: Erlbaum.
- Goodman, K. (1982). *Language and Literacy*. Boston, MA: Routledge & Kegan
- Goodman, K. (1996). *On Reading*. NH: Heinemann

Marilyn McCord, A. (1994). *Beginning to read: thinking and learning about print*. Cambridge, Mass: MIT Press

Mason, J. M., & Allen, J. (1986). A review of emergent literacy with implications for research and practice in reading. In E. Z. Rothkopf (Ed.), *Review of research in education* (Vol. 13, pp. 3- 47). Washington, DC: American Educational Research Association.

Moats, L. C. (2000). *Whole language lives on: The illusion of "Balanced Reading" instruction*. Washington, DC: Thomas B. Fordham Foundation.

Vygotsky, L. S. (1978). *Mind in society: The development of higher psychological processes*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press