

Terms of Reference - Udaan Tracer Study

1. Background

CARE India Solutions for Sustainable Development (CARE India) has been working in India for over 70 years, focusing on alleviating poverty and social exclusion. We do this through well-planned and comprehensive programmes in health, education, livelihoods and disaster preparedness and response. We also focus on generating and sharing knowledge with diverse stakeholders to influence sustainable impact at scale. Our overall goal is the empowerment of women and girls from poor and marginalized communities, leading to improvement in their lives and livelihoods. We are part of the CARE International Confederation working in over 100 countries for a world where all people live with dignity and security.

The girls' education program of CARE india has been working towards ensuring equitable education for most marginalised children especially girls. GEP started its journey in late 90s with an aim to provide second chance to adolescent girls from most marginalised communities to continue formal schooling and make informed life choice.

Since 1999, CARE India has implemented an innovative accelerated learning program for adolescent girls in rural areas of India. Udaan (meaning Flight) is an innovative model providing alternative schooling to girls aged 11 to 14 years who have either never been to school, or who had to drop out due to socio-economic reasons. The Udaan residential program provides accelerated schooling, which allows 100 girls every year to enter the formal system of education. Through an age-appropriate curriculum, these girls are fast tracked through the first five years of education in a span of eleven months. On graduation, they are eligible for a place in state level schools. Udaan is unique both in terms of the teaching methods used, and the relationships developed between the teachers and the students. It not only provides graduates with educational opportunities, but also empowers them with a sense of confidence in their own abilities.

Beginning in 2018, some components of the Udaan curriculum, particularly the leadership curriculum and building of individual agency, and accelerated learning curriculum were adopted by the State Government of Uttar Pradesh to be implemented in their residential girls' schools, known as Kasturba Gandhi Balika Vidyalaya (KGBV).

2. Purpose and Objectives of the Study

The purpose of this study is two-fold.

The first purpose is to conduct a **retrospective tracing of Udaan graduates** (girls who were enrolled in Udaan residential learning program in Hardoi, Uttar Pradesh) to document in what way(s) did the program impact their lives. Based on the available project records, the study would attempt to track Udaan girls who dropped out during the 11-month period, who sat for the finishing exam, who enrolled in a Grade 6 class afterward, and their persistence beyond. However, anecdotal stories indicate that not only might these records be missing some longitudinal impacts of the program, but also that we may not truly be understanding the impact of the 11-month program. For example, some of the project/partner staff mentioned that none of the alumni (approximately 2,200 since 1999) had ever gotten married early or before the recommended age at marriage. They also mentioned that many of the girls didn't immediately get enrolled in Grade 6, but enrolled later, and this isn't reflected in the official records that they're keeping.

The study will allow to better understand what happened to girls who finished Udaan, but dropped out of school at some point afterwards, - how, if at all, are they different from girls who never went through the program? Likewise, for those who have stayed in school, how their learning experiences

are as compared to the other students in their pursuit of continuing studies or career path¹. The study intends to capture the value-add Udaan graduates have gained from Udaan program in their pursuit of continuing studies or career path. What has been some of the outcomes related to life choices that have led to healthier lives and healthier relationships (e.g., delays in marriage, delays in starting families, better health outcomes for the girls and/or family members)?

To that end, the **specific purposes** of the study are:

- i. To understand the long-term impact that Udaan program has made on life of girls (at individual level) including educational outcomes, self-confidence, decision making, negotiation, empowerment, and mobility
- ii. Value add on family/society/school through Udaan girls (at community level) [challenging norms, raising voice, supporting family/sibling to take decision, community/civic action]

The second purpose of this study is to understand the impact of the **expansion of the Udaan curriculum within KGBVs**. This includes both the reach of the curriculum to teachers and girls, but also the impact of the added curriculum within the KGBVs. The study will try to answer the questions - In what ways does it change the experience the girls have while at the KGBVs, such as their learning outcomes, retention and completion, and their enjoyment of learning? Additionally, in what ways, if any, did it change the way the teachers at the KGBV centers teach the girls? Finally, what is the fidelity of implementation of the added curriculum as it is taught through the trickle-down approach to reach the teachers at the KGBV schools.

To that end, the **specific purpose** is:

- iii. To gather evidence for scalability of the program at system level and to develop a systematic research-based case study protocol for how to work with government partners on influencing curriculum and teaching methods/methodologies. This should include
 - Approaches for expansion of Udaan curriculum to other states like Jharkhand and other locations in Uttar Pradesh Including lessons around standardization of government partnership-building methods and protocols.
 - Assessments of the fidelity of implementation of scaled models through government across different types/model of KGBVs.

3. Key Objectives of the Study

1. To trace the girls who were enrolled in Udaan residential learning program and to understand the impact their participation in the Udaan program has made on their lives. Included in this is the tracking of each girls' transition journey after completing Udaan: did they go back to school, for how long, what did they do after leaving school.
2. To comprehend how the capacities of Udaan girls have enabled them to face challenges across multiple spheres and to follow their aspirations.
3. What contributions did Udaan make to girls' socio-economic, political, health spheres of their lives upon finishing the program, for example,
 - a. Did they have the option to choose a career path, and if so, what path did they choose?
 - b. Did they have an option if and with whom to marry; if/when/how they wanted to have children; at what ages for both?
 - c. Have they chosen to be engaged in their communities; and if yes, in what ways?
4. To capture stories from Udaan graduates on the impact of the program.
5. To gather Udaan graduates' recommendations for the Udaan program in terms of its content, structure, delivery etc.

¹ National/district level data can be used for the comparison, besides conducting FGDs and IDIs with non-Udaan graduates of same villages from last 5-7 cohort having 5-7 girls in each cohort

6. To assess the past scaling journey of the curriculum across KGBVs (e.g., to understand if/how the curriculum was actually scaled at all KGBVs, and how this translated for KGBV teachers: did they receive training/ongoing support on its delivery, and if/how they implemented it). Include in this the journey of curriculum updates over the life of Udaan, and recommendations for when/how curricula need to be updated, and why.
7. From this, develop policy recommendations for future scaling of specific components through government, including how it can be localized and operationalized at KGBV centers- from the top/down and bottom/up.

4. Study Design and Methodology

Sample size

The study will include both quantitative and qualitative methods for data collection from Udaan graduates to understand the process and impact of the Udaan model. For the quantitative individual interviews, the study should find all 2200 Udaan graduates from Hardoi, across batches. The study will attempt to compare girls who went through the Udaan centers with any existing non-Udaan girl's data available through other surveys on parameters around informed decision-making process and exercising their agency. In addition to the interviews, focused group discussions (FGDs) with Udaan graduates and in-depth interviews will be conducted with other relevant stakeholders such as partner staff. FGDs should include a minimum of one FGD per cohort (20-22 FGDs in all for Udaan graduates); each FGD should have 5-7 participants. In addition to this, 8-10 FGDs/IDIs will be conducted with girls who have never been part of Udaan program from the recent cohorts.

As Udaan curriculum was scaled through the KGBV program, the study will include data collection from KGBV schools. In-depth interviews (IDI) will be conducted with KGBV teachers and state level coordinators and SCERT official. Identify KGBV school teachers who taught before the introduction of the Udaan curriculum as well as after the introduction of the Udaan curriculum and gain understanding from them about using the Udaan curriculum. Conduct a series of field observation visits, using an approved survey tool to understand the key modifications, and level of adoption, from teachers to the Udaan curriculum and delivery components. Also capture the monitoring and feedback system established by the education department to ensure that data from KGBVs is informing decision-making at various levels. Based on the process used for scaling, document the protocol for how to work with government partners on influencing or improving curriculum and teaching methods/methodologies.

Respondent type	Tool to be used	Sample
Udaan graduates	Structured interview	2200 Udaan graduates and 25-30 Non Udaan graduates
	FGDs	22 (Udaan graduates) +10 (non-Udaan)
KGBV teachers	IDI	10-15 (one from each KGBV)
KGBV coordinator at state level	IDI	1
SCERT official	IDI	1
Partner staff	IDI	1
CARE India project staff/technical team	IDI	3

Besides this agency/consultant should develop accompanying products such as case study videos, written stories which highlight the journeys of particular girls, situating their journey within the broader trends the tracer study highlights. Gather individual stories, photos, and videos of a sub-

sample of the graduates, telling their stories, the impact of the program, and their recommendations for future Udaan classes (both recommendations for future Udaan girls and for those designing Udaan centers and classes).

Tool Development

The quantitative survey should be collected using a digital platform such as Kobo. After quantitative and qualitative tools are finalized and signed-off by CISSD and CUSA, they should be translated and back-translated to Hindi.

Training

Training for enumerators will include following components:

- Train 5 Udaan graduates from each cohort (total around 75 girls) as enumerators so they can find their peers and conduct interviews. Training should include lecture and mock practice sessions. Tracing and listing of Udaan girls will be done by the trained enumerators in collaboration with local implementing partner. The surveys could be done in person and/or over the phone (for those that have phones).
- Train a set of research enumerators to conduct the qualitative surveys with Udaan graduates and surveys with KGBV schools/teachers.
- Enumerators should have a chance to practice data collection during a data collection pilot. Data collection supervisors and the local research team/consultant should work with the enumerators during this pilot period to identify strategies for enhancing the data collection process and maintaining data quality

Data collection

- Tracing attempts should include all (nearly 2,200) Udaan graduates from the Hardoi center. The agency/researcher should include in their inception report the tracing protocols; for example, what are the criteria, and after what steps would we determine that an Udaan participant can/cannot be found. The quantitative survey would be conducted with all Udaan participants we can locate in-person and/or by telephone. Quantitative and Qualitative data through FGDs will be collected with girls who did not went through the Udaan centers.
- Propose a strategy for data collection, clearly identifying any strata which should be considered when determining the sample size of KGBV centers/teachers to interview.
- Besides this, agency/researcher should develop accompanying products such as case study videos, written stories which highlight the journeys of particular girls, situating their journey within the broader trends the tracer study highlights. With the Udaan graduates and Udaan teachers, develop a strategy for localized storytelling and visualization strategies for showing their journeys. For example, this may be through the use of photo voice, video voice, paintings, journey maps, etc. This should be led by the Udaan participants in the ways they want to tell their story of their respective cohort. Each cohort should have its own product.
- All quantitative data should be collected electronically, using Kobo collect or a similar platform. Quantitative data of individual girls and teachers should be collected via individual interviews, not in group sessions, except for conducting FGDs.
- Quantitative data files should be uploaded from the individual phones/tablets nightly. During this process, the local research team/consultant should check the data for completeness, quality of data collection, and identify any errors so they can be addressed the next day. Access to this main cloud-based database should be shared directly with CARE India. Qualitative recordings should also be uploaded to a cloud-based server nightly.
- Study team should lead daily meetings to discuss what went well, challenges, and to upload data to the cloud.

5. Key information areas

The study tools should be able to capture quantitative and qualitative information with respect to the following.

Udaan graduates

- a. How far they advanced in school, including any periods in which they dropped out and later re-entered school. (Quantitative survey)
 - How they negotiated for their studies (Quantitative and qualitative)
- b. At what age they married (Quantitative survey)
 - How they decided to get married (Quantitative and qualitative)
 - How they address/ed traditional gender norms in their families (Quantitative and qualitative)
- c. At what age they first had a child, and how many children they have had (Quantitative survey)
 - For those with children, their children's education levels
 - Their engagement levels in their communities (Quantitative and qualitative)
- d. Their self-perceived leadership abilities and application of leadership competencies (Quantitative and qualitative)
- e. What kind/s of public spaces or leadership position/s they have occupied (Quantitative and Qualitative).
- f. Issues they faced in their lives, key decision points
- g. Economic empowerment/status/engagement now – jobs, income levels, savings etc. (Quantitative survey)
- h. Perceptions on how their lives have shifted (Qualitative)

KGBV schools/teachers

- a. Did they receive the curriculum and/or training and/or ongoing support on the curriculum?
- b. If and in what ways their teaching and classroom management practices changed?
- c. If and how students engaged differently – academically, socio-emotionally, education trajectory
- d. What recommendations do they have for any future updates to the curriculum and training schemes for it?

Government officials to understand the scaling process

- a. What has gone well to date?
- b. Challenges
- c. Recommendations for future scaling processes
- d. What the government looks for when considering the incorporation of curriculum in their schools [using leadership curriculum as a talking point potentially as well?]
- e. Perceived benefits
- f. Gaps and or demands for further scaling within UP or other state governments
- g. Cost considerations
- h. Ties with national policies on girls' education/out-of-school children, inclusion, gender equity, etc.

6. Data analysis

Quantitative data analysis needs to go beyond basic descriptive statistics and cross-tabulations. Analysis should also look at the statistical relationship and influence of multiple indicators to understand if there are predictive relationships between different indicators (particularly indicators that are continuous in nature, such as the age of marriage, age at first birth, number of years stayed in school, youth leadership index (YLI), etc.). For example, does the number of years of schooling completed influence the age at first birth? Do self-perceptions of leadership (YLI) influence if the girl

had a choice about with whom to marry, and the age at which she married? Are there statistical differences in trends in girls from different backgrounds (e.g. caste, religious affiliation, family type)?

Qualitative data collection sessions should be recorded using digital recording devices. This data should later be transcribed exactly as the interviews that took place; summary transcription is not acceptable. If qualitative analysis will be done in the same language as the interviews, no translation is needed. If analysis will be done in another language, such as English, full translation of the transcripts is required. Qualitative data analysis should use trends analysis. The agency/consultant should produce a list of pre-determined thematic codes as well as emergent codes that come out of multiple iterations of qualitative data coding.

8. Scope of Work for the Agency

- Finalize study design in close association with CARE India team, considering the study commitments.
- Develop and finalize study tools including pre-testing, incorporation of feedback and translation in local language (Hindi). The study tools should capture all relevant areas/questions highlighted in the ToR.
- Develop tracing protocols to be commonly followed by enumerators. The guideline will include what are the criteria, and after what steps would we determine that an Udaan participant can/cannot be found.
- Develop strategy for KGBV school selection, clearly identifying any strata which should be considered when determining the sample size of KGBV centers/teachers for interview.
- Train selected Udaan graduates as field enumerators for listing and data collection. Training of enumerators should focus on developing a shared understanding of the study objectives, understanding of the study instruments and the quality control mechanism to be adhered for data collection.
- Appoint adequate human resources/research associates for data collection and share a supervision plan to monitor data collection. For quantitative data collection with Udaan graduates, a set of identified Udaan girls can be leveraged and trained to collect data of other Udaan graduates. CARE India/partner organization can provide support in that.
- Design and put in place quality control protocols for ensuring quality data collection, analysis, and report preparation and share with CARE India
- Share all qualitative and quantitative data and information in appropriate formats with CARE India
- Develop data analysis framework and share with CARE India for approval
- Prepare the draft report in a reporting template agreed with CARE India.
- Submission of draft report and presentation of baseline study findings to CARE India and other stakeholders (as required)
- Incorporate feedback and comments received by CARE India in a clear and concise way while preparing the final baseline report.
- Submit the final study report after incorporating key stakeholders' and CARE India's inputs and comments.
- Submit report of case study documentation.
- Submit video documentation capturing journey of few Udaan graduates

9. Support to be Provided by CARE India

The following support will be provided by CARE to the selected agency:

- List of Intervention areas.
- Project's logical framework and other project related information
- Inputs for finalization of study design (including sampling), methodology and tools

- Inputs and comments for finalization of the baseline study reports.

10. Deliverables by the Agency/Consultant

The agency/consultant selected for undertaking the study will be responsible for providing the following deliverables to CARE India.

- Inception report which outlines specific methodology, steps to ensure data quality, data security, and an overall timeline for processes
- Detailed study design, detailed plans for execution of the study and quality assurance protocols
- Final study tools (both quantitative and qualitative) in Hindi and English language (along with the fonts) adapted for use via electronic data collection.
- Enumerator training schedule and training materials
- Application for data collection
- Field movement plan and quality assurance plan that will be followed during the survey
- Listing of Udaan girls and generate an electronic database of all Udaan graduates including key indicators and contact information for future follow-up.
- Complete databases with all quantitative and qualitative data collected in this study. All quantitative data must be accompanied by a complete codebook and be delivered in both SPSS and Excel formats. All qualitative data must be catalogues in a matrix, including file names for both audio files and transcriptions. Qualitative thematic codes (pre-determined codes and emergent codes) must also be identified and defined in a single document.
- Draft and final Udaan Tracer study report
- Case study documentation - A series of fifteen to twenty stories of Udaan graduates, across the age span, telling their stories, the impact of the program, and their recommendations for future Udaan classes (both recommendations for current and future Udaan girls, and for those designing Udaan centers and classes). This should be in written form, including multiple high-quality photographs of each girl and photo release waivers.
- Two videos showcasing the perspectives of Udaan girls; one video for each of the following areas: (1) their recommendations for future girls and parents/caregivers who are thinking about attending an accelerated learning program; and (2) their recommendations for teachers and those designing future accelerated education programs like Udaan (e.g., NGO workers, education officials from relevant education ministry departments). The videos should also include some b-roll footage of the current Udaan center and students.
- A comprehensive scaling study documenting the scaling journey of the Udaan curriculum's inclusion in government KGBV schools, including key recommendations and process mapping for future scaling work.

11. Data Rights

A contract for this project will only be awarded on the condition that all information, reports and plans, both print and electronic that may have been designed specifically for this project, in whatever format, will belong to CARE India. The Agency must not use the data for their own research purposes, nor license the data to be used by others, without the written permission from CARE India.

12. Final Report Requirements

The agency is accountable to maintain the requirements for the content, format, or length of the final reports, overall quality and approved timelines for the study. The final report should include (at a minimum) the following elements:

- Acknowledgements
- List of Acronyms and abbreviations
- Table of Contents

- Executive Summary
- Background (Brief program description and context)
- Purpose and expected use of the survey
- Objectives of the study
- Study design and methodology (including limitations of the study, if any)
- Key findings (include illustrations in the form of tables and charts)
- Conclusion and Recommendations

13. Timeline

Six months from the date of commission of the study. The agency will propose a detailed timeline in its proposal and strictly adhere to the agreed schedule.